# Summary

#### **Art Studies Journal**

No. 1, 2019

Published by the State Institute for Art Studies, Moscow

#### **Editorial Staff**

Nikolai Molok, PhD in History of Art Editor-in-chief

Evgenia Shidlovskaya, PhD in History of Art Deputy Editor

Alla Vershinina, PhD in History of Art Deputy Editor

Lyudmila Antonova, PhD in History Executive Editor

#### **Editorial Board**

Andrei Batalov, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art), Professor Ekaterina Bobrinskaya, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art) John E. Bowlt, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art), Professor Ilya Doronchenkov, PhD in History of Art, Associate Professor Tatiana Gnedovskava, PhD. Doctor of Science (History of Art) Mikhail lampolsky, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art), Professor Arkady Ippolitov, art historian, curator Irina Karasik, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art) Tatiana Karpova, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art) Armen Kazaryan, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art), corresponding member of the Russian Academy of Architecture Anna Korndorf, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art) Lev Lifshits, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art) Olga Medvedkova, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art), Professor Viktor Misiano, PhD in History of Art Alla Rosenfeld, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art), Professor Elena Sharnova, PhD in History of Art, Associate Professor Alexandra Shatskikh, PhD in History of Art Sharif Shukurov, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art) Dmitry Shvidkovsky, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art), Professor, member of the Russian Academy of Arts, member of the Russian Academy of Architecture Natalia Sipovskaya, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art) Marina Sviderskaya, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art), Professor Lucia Tonini, PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art), Professor

# Contents

#### THEORY

#### RENAISSANCE

10 Olga Nazarova. The View of an Era:
How the Social History of Art
Changed the History of Italian
Renaissance Art

#### **VITRUVIUS**

36 Ivan Sablin. Wood and Stone in the History of Architecture

#### STEREOTOMY

**Yulia Klimenko.** The "Secret of Architecture": From Gothic to French Classicism

#### AVANT-GARDE

80 Alexei Kurbanovsky. The Russian
Experimental Field. Fantastical Texts;
the "Biosocial Project"; the Paintings
by Pavel Filonov

#### HISTORY

#### ICONOGRAPHY

Marina Gorbunova. Medieval Fortune: Images, Texts, Meanings
Evgeny Yaylenko. Titian's Tarquin and Lucretia: the Ancient Story in the Context of the Erotic Discourse

of the Renaissance

#### **Abstracts**

188 Maria Demidova, "The Dance

> of Human Life": Hypnerotomachia Polyphili and other sources of the painting

by Nicolas Poussin

#### COLLECTIONS

222 Elena Sharnova. The Catalogue

> of Alexander Stroganov's Collection and the French Auction Catalogue Tradition in the Second Half of the 18th Century

#### ART AND POLITICS

250 Evgeny Kononenko. The Şehzade

Mosque in Istanbul: Reconstructing the

Original Concept

#### **BOOKS REVIEWS**

282 Ekaterina Ivanova.

> Natalia Murray. The Unsung Hero of the Russian Avant-Garde: the Life and Times of Nikolay Punin. Moscow: Slovo, 2018

290 Tatyana Sinelnikova. Naive Art and

> Kitsch in the Discussion Field (Naive Art and Kitsch. Key Problems and Specifics of Perception / Ed. by N. Musyankova. St. Petersburg: Aletheia,

2018)

#### CHRONICLE

306 Tatyana Gnedovskaya, Elena Markus.

> The Architecture of the Industrial and Post-Industrial Eras: 19th-21st Centuries. Core Processes, International Scientific Conference, State Institute of Art Studies. Moscow, 12-14 September 2018

**ABSTRACTS** 

329

CONTRIBUTORS

333

INFORMATION FOR CONTRIBUTORS

335

#### Olga Nazarova

#### The View of an Era: How the Social History of Art Changed the **History of Italian Renaissance Art**

The article looks at one of the principle approaches to art history in use today the social history of art. A review of its methods, from emergence in the mid-20th century to triumphant affirmation in academic art studies during the 1980s-1990s, shows how the objectives of the social history of art took shape over time, how they entailed a shift in the research focus from "the world of the artist" to "the world of the patron", and how, by the start of the 21st century, the principles and the approaches used by the social history of art had changed traditional ideas about the art of the Renaissance, which were fashioned by "old" art historical methods. The article also looks at the effect of these changes on the structure and content of contemporary scientific publications, art exhibitions and study courses.

Key words: methodology of art history, history of the history of art, history of the study of Renaissance art.

#### Ivan Sablin

#### Wood and Stone in the History of Architecture

The article deals with the use of traditional materials in architecture, comparing specific aspects of building in stone as opposed to building in wood — the first more durable, the second more tradition-bound, but at the same time simpler in execution and therefore apt to serve as an "incubator" for the chief devices of "real" (stone) architecture. The article makes reference to the role of Vitruvius' theory in the modern period.

**Key words:** wood, stone, building materials, constructions, theory of Vitruvius, primitive hut, ecclesiastical architecture.

#### Yulia Klimenko

#### The "Secret of Architecture": From Gothic to French Classicism

The article considers the role of stone in the evolution of French architecture from gothic to classicism, reviewing a series of works of French architecture that reflect the headlong development of knowledge about stereotomy, based on the ideas of Cartesianism. The virtuoso toolkit of construction in stone, combining "the lightness of gothic churches with the purity and grandeur of Greek architecture", led to the appearance of French neoclassicism, a new style defined by scenographic possibilities, plasticity of volumetric and spatial solutions, a new level of comfort and exact correspondence of "internal" and "external" (plan, façade and cross-section). **Key words:** stereotomy, works of architecture, engineering art, historical and architectural analysis, reconstruction.

#### Alexei Kurbanovsky

## The Russian Experimental Field. Fantastical Texts; the "Biosocial Project"; the Paintings by Pavel Filonov

Contemporary researchers have noted that Pavel Filonov was influenced from a young age by popular entertainments — shows of savages and monsters — that displayed a "modified body" to spectators. The present article complements that intuition by parallels with the popular science-fiction literature of the early 20th century, which explored the theme of transmutation of the body. Possible textual prototypes are proposed for some of Filonov's motifs and a heuristic hypothesis is put forward of the artist's affinity with Mannerism, which had been rediscovered and actualised in the art of the 1920s. It is suggested that Filonov's art is the most appropriate "iconological support" of the Revolution's biosocial project to "nurture a new (improved) human being".

**Key words:** gothic literature, biology, body, monster, experiment, Mannerism, eugenics, biosocial project, new human being.

#### Marina Gorbunova

#### Medieval Fortune: Images, Texts, Meanings

The article proposes a classification of monuments of medieval art depicting the image of Fortune and/or her wheel from the 11<sup>th</sup> to the 15<sup>th</sup> centuries and analyzes themes, in which Fortune plays a part. The author outlines the main groups of works, argues why the groupings are appropriate, brings out the main iconographic features of each category, and considers the reasons for its emergence. The study is based on the analysis of a broad range of art works, literary texts, philosophical treatises and medieval encyclopedias. The theme is new as an object of in-depth research in Russian art studies.

**Key words:** astrology, Fortune, gothic cathedral, iconography, medieval encyclopedia. Tree of Life, Wheel of Fortune.

#### **Evgeny Yaylenko**

### Titian's Tarquin and Lucretia: the Ancient Story in the Context of the Erotic Discourse of the Renaissance

The article analyzes the evolution of the theme of Tarquin and Lucretia in the work of Titian, who returned to it at least four times. The change in Titian's pictorial interpretation of the ancient legend reflects not only the development of his creative interests, but also the variety of influences on the Venetian artist, from the works of Lucas Cranach the Elder and Raphael in his early years, to engravings by the masters of the Northern Renaissance in a later period. A fundamental stylistic paradigm may also have been provided by the series of erotic engravings, *I modi*, made by Marcantonio Raimondi from the drawings of Giulio Romano. The supposition of *I modi* as a possible source of Titian's artistic invention opens the broader question of the role of of erotica in Renaissance art.

Key words: Renaissance, Mannerism, Titian, engraving, erotic.

#### Maria Demidova

# "The Dance of Human Life": *Hypnerotomachia Polyphili* and other sources of the painting by Nicolas Poussin

The painting by Nicolas Poussin *A Dance to the Music of Time* (c. 1638; London, Wallace Collection) has been the subject of many interpretations. But the iconographic programme of the work includes aspects, to which attention was drawn as early as the 17<sup>th</sup> century and which remain unclear. The present article reviews the best known interpretations of the *Dance* and considers in particular what it may owe to the literary romance by Francesco Colonna, *Hypnerotomachia Poliphili*. We believe that one of the illustrations in the latter work may have done much to inspire Poussin's picture. **Key words:** Nicolas Poussin, Giulio Rospigliosi, Francesco Colonna, Cesare Ripa, the Eikones of Philostratus, Blaise de Vigenère, the Wheel of Fortune, allegory of the seasons.

#### Elena Sharnova

# The Catalogue of Alexander Stroganov's Collection and the French Auction Catalogue Tradition in the Second Half of the 18th Century

The practice of compiling catalogues of art collections arose in France in the second half of the 18th century. With rare exceptions, the catalogues were published in preparation for an auction, and the authors were *marchands*. The catalogue of Alexander Stroganov's collection is a rare instance where the author was the owner of the collection. Having created the collection, Stroganov offers an interpretation of it. Two editions of the catalogue were published in French (in 1793 and 1800), as well as a folio of masterpieces from the collection with engravings of the works (1807). Stroganov followed the best French examples (notably the catalogues of Pierre Rémy). However, he showed independence in many of his reasonings and judgments. He specified attributions, and provided information about the state of preservation and restoration of the paintings. The catalogue also includes Stroganov's thoughts on matters of the theory and history of art.

**Contributors** 

**Key words:** Alexander Stroganov, Denis Diderot, Roger de Piles, J.-B. Descamps, collection catalogues, attribution.

#### Evgeny Kononenko The Şehzade Mosque in Istanbul: Reconstructing the Original Concept

The article is devoted to the Şehzade Mosque in Istanbul (1543–1548), one of the greatest works of the outstanding Ottoman architect, Sinan. The motive for the creation of the mosque is traditionally supposed to have been the death of Mehmed, the heir ("sehzade") to the Ottoman throne, but the mosque does not correspond to the funerary memorial typology, which was well established in Ottoman architecture by the 16th century. Specific compositional elements testify to a change in the nature of the building in the course of its construction, and this is also suggested by various city legends and by archive documents that were not previously consulted in this context. Reconstruction of the motives for and chronology of the construction of the mosque offers answers to outstanding questions about this project of Suleiman the Magnificent, clarifying the significance of the Şehzade Mosque in the Ottoman layout of Istanbul and its place in the work of Sinan.

**Key words:** Islamic architecture, the Great Ottoman Mosque, Kullie, Şehzade Mosque, Sinan, Istanbul, Süleymaniye Mosque.

#### Ekaterina Ivanova

Natalia Murray. The Unsung Hero of the Russian Avant-Garde: the Life and Times of Nikolay Punin. Moscow: Slovo, 2018.

#### Tatyana Sinelnikova Naive Art and Kitsch in the Discussion Field

Naive Art and Kitsch. Key Problems and Specifics of Perception / Ed. by N. Musyankova. St. Petersburg: Aletheia, 2018.

#### Tatyana Gnedovskaya, Elena Markus

The Architecture of the Industrial and Post-Industrial Eras: 19<sup>th</sup>–21<sup>st</sup> Centuries. Core Processes, International Scientific Conference. State Institute of Art Studies, Moscow, 12–14 September 2018.

#### Maria Demidova

PhD in History of Art, senior researcher at the Department of European Classical Art, State Institute for Art Studies (SIAS), Associate Professor at the Department of History and Theory of Christian Art of the St. Tikhon Orthodox University. Moscow. mardemidova@yandex.ru

#### Tatiana Gnedovskaya

PhD, Doctor of Science (History of Art). Leading researcher at the State Institute for Art Studies (SIAS). Specialist in European art and architecture of the first half of the 20th century. Member of the Union of Moscow Architects. Moscow. tgnedovskaya@gmail.com

#### Marina Gorbunova

PhD student, Department of Art History, Faculty of History, Moscow State University. Moscow.

m.a.gorbunova@gmail.com

#### Ekaterina Ivanova

PhD student, Faculty of History of Arts, European University in St. Petersburg. St. Petersburg. ekivanova@eu.spb.ru

#### Yulia Klimenko

PhD in Architecture, Professor of the Department of the History of Architecture and Town-Planning, Moscow Institute of Architecture (State Academy). Moscow. y-klim@yandex.ru

#### **Evgeny Kononeko**

PhD in History of Art, Head of the Department of Asian and African Art, State Institute of Art Studies (SIAS). Moscow.

j\_kononenko@inbox.ru

#### Alexei Kurbanovsky

Art historian, art critic, translator. PhD, Doctor of Science (Philosophy), leading researcher at the State Russian Museum, Professor at St. Petersburg Rimsky-Korsakov Conservatory and at the European University. St. Petersburg. axkurban@mail.ru

#### Elena Markus

Associate Professor at the Department of the Theory and History of Architecture, Art and Design, Technische Universität München (TUM). München. elena.markus@tum.de

#### Olga Nazarova

PhD in History of Art, senior lecturer at the National Research University Higher School of Economics, Moscow, associate professor at the Russian State University of the Humanities. Moscow.

o nazarova@mail.ru

#### Ivan Sablin

PhD in History of Art, senior researcher at the Russian Institute of Art History, Associate Professor at the Faculty of Liberal Arts and Sciences, St. Petersburg State University. Author of *The Classical Painting in Russian History of Art* (2015) and *Paintings by Giorgione in the Hermitage Museum* (2018). St. Petersburg. Sablin@eu.spb.ru

#### Elena Sharnova

PhD in History of Art. Associate Professor at the School of History of the Higher School of Economics. Author of the catalogues: French Paintings of the 16<sup>th</sup> to the First Half of the 19<sup>th</sup> Centuries, Pushkin Museum Collection (2001, co-authored with I. Kuznetsova); French Paintings at Arkhangelskoye. Reconstruction of Prince Nikolai Yusupov's French Collection (2011, co-authored with M. Krasnobaeva). Moscow. esharnova@hse.ru

#### Tatiana Sinelnikova

PhD student, Department of Folklore and Folk Art, State Institute of Art Studies (SIAS) custodian at the Polenov Russian State House of Folk Creativity. Moscow. dekorart3@mail.ru

#### **Evgeny Yaylenko**

PhD in History of Art, Associate Professor at the Faculty of Arts, Moscow State University. Moscow. eiailenko@rambler.ru

# **Information for Contributors**

335

The editorial staff and editorial board of Art Studies Journal can only consider materials submitted for publication if they meet the following requirements:

- Articles should be no longer than 60,000 characters with spaces, including notes and bibliographic lists; for post-graduate students and applicants for a degree the upper limit is 40,000 characters.
  - The number of illustrations must be agreed with the editorial staff.
- Texts and illustrations must be submitted by e-mail; they are also accepted on data storage devices.
- Expert assessments of manuscripts are performed by members of the Journal's editorial board.

An article must be accompanied by:

- A review and an excerpt from the minutes of a faculty (section, department) meeting, recommending the article for publication.
- A brief annotation and key words of the article (with an English translation) of up to 800 characters with spaces; information about the author with an indication of his or her academic degree, place of employment, position and e-mail address (with an English translation).

Post-graduate students and applicants for a degree must:

- Indicate the faculty and department of their academic institution or the name of their research institution.
- Provide a review/recommendation from their dissertation adviser, leading specialist or the referring organization (certified by seal).

Guidelines for the submission of articles and illustrations:

- Texts are accepted in MS Word format. Font: Times New Roman; font size
   14 (texts), 12 (notes and bibliography); line spacing
   1.5; indent
   1.25 cm. Quotes:
   4...
   4...
   5...
   6...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
   7...
- All notes must have consecutive numbering and should be placed at the end of the text.
- Each article must end with a bibliographic list in alphabetical order. The reference to a quoted source should be in square brackets with the index number of the source in the bibliographic list and the page number (for example, [1, p. 12]). The bibliographic list should conform to the Russian State Standard of 7.05.2008.
  - Illustrations are accepted in TIFF or JPG formats, with 300 dpi resolution.
- Illustration captions must include the name of the author, title (of the work of art, edifice, etc.), year of creation, material (medium), size, location.

Materials that do not meet these requirements cannot be considered for publication.

No publication fees are charged (this concerns all categories of authors, including post-graduate students). No fees are paid to the author (s).

In accordance with Russian legislation, non-exclusive rights for the publication of manuscripts are given by the author(s) to the periodical's founder and publisher (State Institute for Art Studies). The authors guarantee that the texts submitted for publication in the periodical are their original texts, which have not been officially handed to other parties for reproduction or other use. The authors are responsible for the content of their texts and for the fact of their publication. The editorial staff have the right to abridge the articles, to edit them and to send them to the authors for revision if necessary.